

STATE OF WASHINGTON
OFFICE OF FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT
STATE HUMAN RESOURCES DIVISION | DIRECTOR'S REVIEW PROGRAM
P.O. Box 40911 · Olympia, WA 98504-0911 · (360) 407-4101 · FAX (360) 586-4694

July 24, 2014

TO: Cindy Boekhoff

FROM: Holly Platz, SPHR
Director's Review Program Investigator

SUBJECT: Cindy Boekhoff v. Bellevue College
Allocation Review Request ALLO-13-071

Director's Determination

On July 9, 2014, I conducted a review of the allocation of your position. Present at the review meeting were you and Aaron Hilliard, Vice President of Human Resources for Bellevue College (College). During the review meeting, I requested additional documentation from the College including organizational charts and the supervisor's portion of the Position Review Request form. The College provided the organizational charts on July 18 and you provided the supervisor's portion of the PRR on July 22.

This position review was based on the work performed for the six-month period prior to July 1, 2013, the date the College's Human Resources office (HR) received your request for a position review. As the Director's Review Investigator, I carefully considered all of the documentation in the file; the exhibits, including those I requested during the review meeting; and the verbal comments provided by both parties.

Based on my review and analysis of your assigned duties and responsibilities, I conclude your position is properly allocated to the Administrative Assistant 3 classification.

Background

On June 27, 2013, you completed a Position Review Request form (PRR) asking that your Administrative Assistant 3 (AA3) position be reallocated to the Administrative Assistant 4 (AA4) or the Administrative Services Manager classification. The College's HR office received your request on July 1, 2013. On August 24, 2013, Maria Woods, Human Resources Generalist for the College forwarded her Classification Analysis Report (Exhibit B-2) to Yvonne McGookin, Interim Vice President of Human Resources. Ms. Woods determined that your position was properly allocated to the AA3 classification. By memorandum dated August 28, 2013, Ms. McGookin notified you that she concurred with Ms. Woods' determination (Exhibit B-1).

On September 24, 2013, the State Human Resources Division received your request for a Director's review of the College's allocation determination (Exhibit A-1). In your review request, you indicated that the AA4 classification best describes your duties. During the July 9, 2014

review conference you confirmed that you are requesting reallocation to the AA4 classification but in addition would like me to consider the Administrative Services Manager or the Program Manager classification.

During the conference, you also expressed concerns about equity with other positions at Bellevue College as well as between other colleges in the system. However, in Byrnes v. Dept's of Personnel and Corrections, PRB No. R-ALLO-06-005 (2006), the Board held that "[w]hile a comparison of one position to another similar position may be useful in gaining a better understanding of the duties performed by and the level of responsibility assigned to an incumbent, allocation of a position must be based on the overall duties and responsibilities assigned to an individual position compared to the existing classifications. The allocation or misallocation of a similar position is not a determining factor in the appropriate allocation of a position." Citing to Flahaut v. Dept's of Personnel and Labor and Industries, PAB No. ALLO 96-0009 (1996).

The following summarizes your perspective as well as your employer's:

Summary of Ms. Boekhoff's Perspective

You argue that you interpret policies and processes, counsel and provide advice to program participants and staff, implement program processes consistent with state and local policies, conduct research, prepare program information including budget projections, provide secretarial support such as formatting documents, recording minutes and composing and typing correspondence and arrange and process international travel for staff. You assert that your supervisor and the Vice President for Student Services fully support your reallocation to a higher level classification. In your PRR form you indicated that the primary purpose of your position is to facilitate the administration of the department. During the review conference, you clarified that by "department" you mean the International Student Programs (ISP).

In support of your request for reallocation, you provided a copy of your Performance and Development Plan (PDP) for June 1, 2012 through July 1, 2013 (Exhibit A-7). In your PDP, your position is described as providing "the utmost support to ISP in serving our students, staff, clients in relation to budgeting, purchasing, payment of agents, arrangements of travel and other administrative needs of staff." The PDP also indicates that key results for your position involve:

- notifying agents of their invoice receipt and processing;
- updated and accurate financial reports on ISP budget status, expenses, payments to agents, purchases, travel and reimbursements;
- updated and efficient records keeping and contract maintenance
- physical arrangements for receptions of guests and hosting of events
- timely responses to agents' inquires.

Your supervisor, Assistant Dean Cris Samia, provided support for your reallocation request in an email dated January 17, 2014 (Exhibit A-8). He indicated that you provide the sole administrative support for him and act as his executive secretary. He also indicated that you represent and/or communicated on his behalf on administrative policy matters when needed. In the supervisor's portion of the PRR, he stated that you are "very good in what she does and work[s] with others without any problem, capable of supervising tasks or staff on projects delegated to her."

Summary of the College's Reasoning

The College participated in the review conference but provided no additional argument beyond that provided in the exhibits to support their conclusion that the AA3 classification best describes your position. In the August 24, 2013 Classification Analysis Report (Exhibit B-2), The College described your position as "primarily responsible for gathering information for reports, reconciling budgets, purchasing, assisting with event planning, arranging meetings, interpreting policy for international agents, determining whether or not agents are working within the parameters of the contract, assigning work to part-time staff, assisting with projects, preparing and distributing agent agreements, handling travel arrangements, and coordinating projects with other departments." The College determined that you spend a majority of your time "interpreting, counseling and implementing policies and procedures, preparing cost estimates, preparing and reconciling international travel, and preparing agent agreements and contract proposal for compliance and payment."

Rationale for Director's Determination

The purpose of a position review is to determine which classification best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of a position. A position review is neither a measurement of the volume of work performed, nor an evaluation of the expertise with which that work is performed. A position review is a comparison of the duties and responsibilities of a particular position to the available classification specifications. This review results in a determination of the class that best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of the position. Liddle-Stamper v. Washington State University, PAB Case No. 3722-A2 (1994).

It is clear from the comments of your supervisor that you are very good at your job and your work is highly valued. However, as stated above, a position review is not an evaluation of your expertise. Rather, a review is a comparison of the duties and responsibilities assigned to a position with the available classification specifications.

Most positions within the civil service system occasionally perform duties that appear in more than one classification. However, when determining the appropriate classification for a specific position, the duties and responsibilities of that position must be considered in their entirety and the position must be allocated to the classification that provides the best fit overall for the majority of the position's duties and responsibilities. See Dudley v. Dept. of Labor and Industries, PRB Case No. R-ALLO-07-007 (2007).

Duties and Responsibilities

In your PRR form, you describe your major duties using the typical work statements from the Administrative Services Manager classification as guidance. You also describe the tasks that you perform as follows:

30% Interpret, counsel and implement institutional policies and procedures

International travel policies and procedures, purchases, agent contracts, payments, etc.

(During the review meeting, you clarified that you follow the travel and purchasing procedures developed by the State of Washington. You apply the state criteria using the processes you developed for completing your work. You clarified that the work processes you developed are for accomplishing your work and that your processes do not change what the state requires. You also clarified that you make purchases with the concurrence of your supervisor using a procurement card. Both you and your supervisor

sign off on procurement card purchases which are then forwarded to the Vice President for Administrative Services for approval of payment.)

- 30% Prepare cost estimates and projects of future needs and effect proposed actions

Prepare and reconcile all international travel with currency exchange, travel insurance, etc., for assistant dean, director, assistant directors, etc. With over 65 countries represented at Bellevue College, staff travel has included Istanbul, Iceland, Amsterdam, Copenhagen, Kuwait, Dhabi, Amman, Bahrain, Fukuoka, Osaka, Nagoya, Tokyo, Kyoto, Shanghai, London, Frankfurt, Seoul, Hanoi, Dannang, Ho Ci Minh City, Kuala Lumpur, Jakarta, Guangzhou, Bangkok, etc.

(During the review conference, you provided an example of preparing cost estimates and projecting future expenses. You indicated that you compile a report of expenses for the last two quarters. Then, using this information, you project the amount of funds that will be needed in the future. You estimate how much travel costs will be for the projections based on airline costs, hotels, per diem, travel insurance cost, etc. You clarified that you and your supervisor work together to develop the budget.)

- 10% Research, prepare, and review budget request and provide advice and information

Department and special program needs include events, equipment, supplies, construction, etc., and budget reconciliation. Research and problem solve budget, agent and vendor issues.

(During the review conference, you indicated that you and your supervisor review ISP's budget and determine the funds remaining for the year and how those funds should be spent. After you and your supervisor determined the equipment, furniture, supplies or other items that should be purchased, you research and buy the items. The purchases are approved by your supervisor who signs the purchase order and then you complete the purchase.)

- 20% Prepare agent agreements and contract proposals in compliance with state policies

Communicate with all International agents for compliance and payments. Bellevue College has more than 164 active agents including International Cross Cultural Committee, Edukarsa Student Services, Uihakmentor, Litz, Viet Au My Company Limited, Ryugaku Journal, United Global Education, etc.

(During the review conference, you clarified that the Vice President for Administrative Services signs the agreements and contracts. The Vice President for Administrative Services is not in the chain of command for ISP. You send the agreements to the agents for signature. When the agents have signed and returned the agreements, you forward them to the Vice President for Administrative Services for signature. The Vice President is responsible for finance, operations, purchasing, etc.)

- 10% Prepare and maintain administrative, business and academic reports and records.

Provide secretarial support to head of ISP, format, record minutes, compose, edit and type letters

Contact state agencies and compile reports for assistant dean and ISP staff. Compose and edit letters for parents, embassy, etc. Record minutes for staff and meetings with International agencies.

Class Specifications

The following classification standards, in descending order, are the primary considerations in allocating positions:

- a) Category concept (if one exists).
- b) Definition or basic function of the class.
- c) Distinguishing characteristics of a class.
- d) Class series concept, definition/basic function, and distinguishing characteristics of other classes in the series in question.

In addition, while not allocating criteria, the typical work or examples of work statements provide support to the duties typically performed at each level within the class series and the Glossary of Classification Terms provides guidance for interpreting the language used in the class specifications.

You asked that I consider the Program Manager classifications which I did. I also reviewed the Program Specialist classifications and the Program Coordinator classification.

Program Manager:

The definition for the Program Manager class series states:

Supervise a division of a major administrative department, operating unit or program undertaking relieving the senior official of operating and administrative detail. Plan, coordinate and implement all functions required by the activity.

Your position does not supervise the ISP relieving your supervisor of operating and administrative detail. You do not plan, coordinate and implement all functions required by the program. Rather, you and your supervisor collaborate on many of the operating and administrative details of the program. I recognize that your supervisor is frequently away from the office and that you speak on his behalf and represent the program in his absence. However you have not been given supervisory responsibility for all the functions required by the ISP.

In addition, Program Managers at the "A" level are typically first level supervisors and are characterized by their total responsibility for a program or management services to an administrative supervisor. (See Program Manager A distinguishing characteristics). You are not a first level supervisor; rather your PRR indicates that you lead two part time students whose work hours total 27 hours per week. Additionally, you do not have total responsibility for the program or management services of the program. Your position does not fit within the Program Manager class series.

Program Specialist:

The class series concept for the Program Specialist classes states:

Positions in this series coordinate discrete, specialized programs consisting of specific components and tasks that are unique to a particular subject and are separate and distinguished from the main body of an organization. Positions coordinate program services and resources; act as a program liaison and provide consultation to program participants and outside entities regarding functions of the program; interpret, review and apply program specific policies, procedures and regulations; assess program needs; and develop courses of action to carry out program activities. Program coordination also

requires performance of tasks and application of knowledge unique to the program and not transferable or applicable to other areas of the organization.

Examples of program areas may include, but are not limited to: business enterprises, fund raising, volunteer services, community resources, election administration and certification, juvenile delinquency prevention, recreational education and safety, energy education, aeronautic operations and safety, student housing, financial aid, and registration.

In Roney v. Spokane Community College, R-ALLO-09-030 (2009), the Personnel Resources Board determined, in part, that the appellant did not meet the class series concept for the Program Specialist series because, while she performed discrete, specialized tasks that were unique to the Veterans Education Program, the Veterans Education Program was not separate and distinguished from the main body of the organization. Rather, the program was a component of the Workforce and Education Department within Student Services Community Career and Employment Services. Here, as in Roney, you perform duties that are specialized and unique to the ISP but the ISP is within Student Services which is the main body of the organization. Student Services includes ISP, Student Success, Student Programs, Financial Aid, Multi-Cultural Services, Disability Resource Center, Athletics and Enrollment Services. ISP is not separate and distinguished from Student Services. Your position is not encompassed by the Program Specialist class series concept.

Program Coordinator:

The class series concept for the Program Coordinator classification provides that positions that coordinate programs:

Perform work requiring knowledge and experience that is specific to a program. Organize and perform work related to program operations independent of the daily administrative office needs of the supervisor. Represent the program to clients, participants and/or members of the public.

A program is a specialized area with specific complex components and discrete tasks which distinguish it from the main body of an organization. A program is specific to a particular subject. The specialized tasks involve interpretation of policies, procedures and regulations, budget coordination/administration, independent functioning and typically, public contact. Duties are not of a general support nature transferable from one program to another. Performance of clerical duties is in support of incumbent's performance of specialized tasks.

The intent of the Program Coordinator classification is further clarified by the definition of "coordinate" found in the Glossary of Classification Terms. The Glossary provides that coordinators "[i]ndependently organize, monitor, evaluate, and make adjustments for a program or activity without supervisory responsibility."

Portions of your position fit within the Program Coordinator classification. However, this class does not encompass the variety of administrative responsibilities you perform on behalf of your supervisor. The Program Coordinator classification is not the best fit for the overall scope, level of responsibility, and breadth of your position.

Administrative Services Manager:

The definition of the Administrative Services Manager class states:

The Administrative Services Manager is responsible directly to the senior academic or administrative official for planning, organizing, implementing, coordinating and controlling all administrative services for a department, College, division, inter-disciplinary center, conglomerate organization or institution exercising independent judgment and decision-making authority. (Emphasis added.)

The Glossary further defines "Administrative" and "Managerial" as follows:

Administrative – Determines or participates in making policy, formulates long-range objectives and programs, and reviews the implementation of programs for conformance to policies and objectives.

Managerial – Plans, coordinates, integrates, executes, controls and evaluates activities and functions of an organization. This includes developing budgets, policies and procedures, service delivery, and staff supervision.

Your position reports to the ISP Assistant Dean who has management responsibility for the program. You do not independently plan, organize, implement, coordinate and control all administrative services for the ISP. Rather, you work in collaboration with your supervisor on administrative tasks such as budget preparation, budget expenditures and purchasing. You do not develop program policies and you do not supervise staff as intended for positions allocated to the Administrative Services Manager classification. In addition, your position is not responsible for the scope of independent judgment and decision-making authority found at the Administrative Services Manager level. Rather you follow, interpret and apply specific state regulations and policies for travel and purchasing and you follow and apply the provisions of contracts and agreements approved by others. Your independent decision-making authority involves day-to-day work processes and administrative support functions such as interpreting and implementing policies and procedures; preparing cost estimates for use by your supervisor; preparing and reconciling expenses for international travel; arranging for international travel; and preparing agent agreements and contract proposals, reviewing agent activities for compliance with the terms of the agreement or contract and determining whether payments are warranted. The definition of the Administrative Services Manager classification is not the best fit for your position.

The distinguishing characteristics for the Administrative Services Manager (ASM) state, in part:

An Administrative Services Manager performs, supervises, directs, provides counsel and assists the head of the organization and other personnel in a variety of management services. The primary purpose is to facilitate the administration of the organization.

These positions normally involve a wide variety of duties. The following services, or similar and closely-related activities, are normally included: project management, funds management, contract administration, management analysis, property management, space management, program and budget planning, public information, personnel administration and staff supervision.

Positions at the "A", "B", and "C" levels are distinguished by the variety of functions performed and the degree of authority and responsibility involved. Factors considered are: size of annual budgets, scope of departmental functions, kinds and volume of services rendered, complexity and diversity of functions, number of personnel for whom services are provided, extent of the manager's supervisory role and degree of and involvement in activity calling for specialized or technical experience and capability, or a particularly high level of performance and the scope of delegated authority and

responsibility for making independent decisions that significantly influence the organization's objectives, programs, services and/or contractual commitments.

....

Your position does not meet the intent of the distinguishing characteristics of the ASM class series. While you exercise a high level of responsibility and independence in performing a variety of tasks in support of the ISP, your duties are best described as providing administrative support for the program rather than managing administrative services for a department. The duties and responsibilities of your position are administrative in nature and do not rise to the level of management services and activities encompassed by the ASM class series.

Administrative Assistant 3 and 4:

In Norton-Nader v. Western Washington University, PRB Case No R-ALLO-08-020 (2009), the Board provided guidance in the interpretation and application of the Administrative Assistant 4 and Administrative Assistant 3 classifications. In Norton-Nader, the appellant served as the assistant on administrative matters for the president of the Faculty Senate. The Board determined that the Faculty Senate was not a major organization such as school, college or major academic or administrative department and that allocation to the AA4 level was not appropriate. The Board concluded that the appellant's position best fit the AA3 level because she performed a variety of high-level administrative support functions, duties and responsibilities which included the oversight and supervision of the day-to-day operations of the Faculty Senate office and her duties were of a substantive nature and included budget management, expenditure control, office space management, equipment purchases, budget development, public relations, management of the Faculty Senate website, and report preparation.

Here, as in Norton-Nader, you perform a variety of high-level administrative support functions, your duties and responsibilities include oversight of the day-to-day operations of the ISP, your duties are of a substantive nature and included budget management, expenditure control, space management, equipment purchases, budget development, public relations with agents and guest and report preparation.

The Administrative Assistant class series does not contain a class series concept. Therefore, the first allocating criterion is the class definition.

The definition for the Administrative Assistant 4 classification states:

Positions serve as the assistant on administrative matters to the head of a state agency, the head of a major sub-division or major operating location of an agency, or to the chief administrator or head of a major organizational unit such as a school, College, or major academic/administrative department.

Your position does not fit this definition. You do not provide administrative support to "the chief administrator or head of a major organizational unit such as a school, College, or major academic/administrative department." Rather, you provide support to the ISP and report to the Assistant Dean for the ISP. The Assistant Dean reports to the Vice President of Student Services. The Vice President is the head of the major administrative department.

The definition of the Administrative Assistant 3 classification provides, "[p]ositions perform varied administrative and secretarial support duties or positions are responsible for one or more major program activities under a second line supervisor."

The distinguishing characteristics of the AA3 classification state:

Positions are delegated higher-level administrative support duties or positions are delegated one or more major program activities that would be performed under a second-level professional supervisor, manager or administrator in WMS Band II or above or in exempt service, chief administrator, or head of a major organizational unit such as a school, College, or major academic or administrative department. Only one position will be allocated to an individual second-line supervisor for those positions performing one or more major program activities.

A major program activity is defined as a function that is a major element of the supervisor's job. The duty must stand alone and would create significant adverse consequences if poorly performed. However, full delegation can't occur if the supervisor's position requires specialized licensure such as attorneys, medical doctors, and engineers.

Higher-level administrative duties are duties of a substantive nature that are appropriate to be performed by the supervisor, manager, administrator, or professional level employee but have been delegated to the administrative assistant to perform. Areas may include but are not limited to, the following: budget development and/or management, expenditure control, office space management, equipment purchases, budget development and/or management, public relations, personnel administration, records management, and report preparation.

Incumbents in these positions represent the supervisor's and/or unit's goals and interests and provide interpretation or explanation of the supervisor's policies or viewpoints.

You perform varied secretarial support duties and higher-level administrative support duties for a first-line supervisor who manages the ISP. Your duties and responsibilities in support of the ISP are an integral, major part of the ISP. If you perform your duties poorly, it would create significant adverse consequences. You contribute to budget development; monitor budget expenditures, agreements and contracts; have extensive contact with staff and agents; manage records; and prepare reports. And, you represent your supervisor in his absence and provide interpretation and explanation of ISP policies and procedures. Your position is described by the distinguishing characteristics of the AA3 classification.

The majority of your duties and responsibilities fit the definition and distinguishing characteristics of the AA3 classification. Your position is properly allocated to the Administrative Assistant 3 classification.

Appeal Rights

RCW 41.06.170 governs the right to appeal. RCW 41.06.170(4) provides, in relevant part, the following:

An employee incumbent in a position at the time of its allocation or reallocation, or the agency utilizing the position, may appeal the allocation or reallocation to the Washington personnel resources board. Notice of such appeal must be filed in writing within thirty days of the action from which appeal is taken.

The mailing address for the Personnel Resources Board (PRB) is P.O. Box 40911, Olympia, Washington, 98504-0911. The PRB Office is located on the 3rd floor of the RAAD Building, 128 10th Avenue SW, Olympia, Washington. The main telephone number is (360) 407-4101, and the fax number is (360) 586-4694.

If no further action is taken, the Director's determination becomes final.

c: Aaron Hilliard, BC
Lisa Skriletz, SHR

Enclosure: List of Exhibits

CINDY BOEKHOFF v BCC
ALLO-13-071

A. Cindy Boekhoff Exhibits

1. Director's Review Request submitted September 24, 2013
2. Exhibits received from Human Resources
3. Administrative Services Manager A Class Specification
4. Cindy's request for information to Yvonne McGookin dated August 30, 2013 with President's Goals for 2013-14 and Priorities for Change: Classified staff from employee survey
5. Information from Yvonne McGookin on information request dated September 29, 2013
6. Cindy's request for information to Yvonne McGookin dated October 8, 2013 and November 12, 2013
7. Cindy's Performance and Development Plan signed by Assistant Dean, Cris Samia and Vice President of Student Services, Ata Karim
8. International Student Programs Table of Organization dated May 24, 2012
9. January 20, 2014 email of support from Cris Samia, Assistant Dean, International Student Programs

B. BCC Exhibits

1. Position review determination letter August 28, 2013 with classification specifications and organizational chart
2. Classification Analysis Report from Maria Woods, HR Generalist, August 24, 2013
3. Position Review Request from Cindy Boekhoff

C. Director's Exhibits submitted after conference

1. July 18, 2014 email from Aaron Hilliard to Holly Platz submitting organizational charts
2. Student Services Organizational Chart
3. Bellevue College Organizational Chart
4. July 22, 2014 email from Cindy Boekhoff to Holly Platz submitting PRR forms
5. Supervisor Portion PRR
6. Employee Portion PRR

D. Class Specifications

1. Administrative Assistant 3
2. Administrative Assistant 4
3. Program Manager
4. Program Specialist
5. Program Coordinator
6. Administrative Services Manager series