



STATE OF WASHINGTON
OFFICE OF FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT

STATE HUMAN RESOURCES DIVISION | DIRECTOR'S REVIEW PROGRAM
P.O. Box 40911 · Olympia, WA 98504-0911 · (360) 407-4101 · FAX (360) 586-4694

November 18, 2014

TO: Elizabeth Henry

FROM: Holly Platz, SPHR
Director's Review Program Investigator

SUBJECT: Elizabeth Henry v. Central Washington University
Allocation Review Request ALLO-14-002

Director's Determination

On November 6, 2014, I conducted a telephonic conference to review the allocation of your position. Present during the review conference were you and Katelyn (Muir) Jones and Lorraine Chavez, Human Resource Consultants for Central Washington University (CWU).

This position review was based on the work performed during the six-month period prior to October 15, 2013, the date CWU's Human Resources office (HR) received the updated position description from your supervisor, Dr. Robert Lupton. As the Director's Review Investigator, I carefully considered all of the documentation in the file; the exhibits and the verbal comments provided by both parties.

Based on my review and analysis of your assigned duties and responsibilities, I conclude your position should be reallocated to the Administrative Assistant 3 classification.

Background

After receiving the updated position description (Exhibits A-6 and B-2), Katelyn (Muir) Jones, Human Resources Consultant with CWU's HR office, conducted a review of your position. By memorandum dated December 5, 2013, Ms. Muir determined that your position was properly allocated to the Secretary Supervisor classification. (Exhibits A-4 and B-1).

On January 2, 2014, the State Human Resources division received your request for a Director's review of CWU's allocation determination (Exhibit A-1). In your review request, you indicated that either the Program Manager A or Program Support Supervisor 2 classification best describes your duties.

In your review request exhibits and during the review conference, you expressed concerns about equity of your position compared to similar or identical positions at CWU that are allocated to program classes. You referenced a recent recruitment for a Program Support Supervisor 2 position that you feel performs work identical to the work that you perform. However, as we discussed during the review conference, the Personnel Resources Board has

addressed this issue on numerous occasions. For example, in Byrnes v. Dept's of Personnel and Corrections, PRB No. R-ALLO-06-005 (2006), the Board held that "[w]hile a comparison of one position to another similar position may be useful in gaining a better understanding of the duties performed by and the level of responsibility assigned to an incumbent, allocation of a position must be based on the overall duties and responsibilities assigned to an individual position compared to the existing classifications. The allocation or misallocation of a similar position is not a determining factor in the appropriate allocation of a position." Citing to Flahaut v. Dept's of Personnel and Labor and Industries, PAB No. ALLO 96-0009 (1996).

Therefore, while I considered your argument regarding the allocation of other positions, their allocation or misallocation is not a determining factor in the allocation of your position.

As background, your position is located in the Information Technology and Administrative Management (ITAM) department. ITAM is within the College of Education and Professional Studies. Your position reports to the Chair of the department, Dr. Robert Lupton. Dr. Lupton reports to the Dean of the College of Education and Professional Studies. Your position provides support to the various academic programs within the department and at the time relevant to this review, worked with four offsite academic centers for ITAM located on campuses in Western Washington. During the time relevant to this review, you were the supervisor for a temporary/hourly tech support position, a communications specialist and an office assistant as well as student employees.

The following summarizes your perspective as well as your employer's:

Summary of Ms. Henry's Perspective

You provided extensive arguments when filing your request for review. (Exhibit A-2) In brief summary, you argued that CWU's decision failed to address your program management duties, failed to consider the percentage of time you perform duties that go beyond the Secretary Supervisor classification, failed to address the use of program classifications by other academic departments, failed to acknowledge your scope of supervision, and failed to accurately assess the scope and responsibilities of your position.

During the review conference, you again addressed CWU's use of the program classes in other academic departments. Specifically, you alleged that a recent Program Support Supervisor 2 recruitment announcement described work identical to the work that you perform. You contend that equity with similar/identical positions at CWU supports your request for reallocation.

You explained that the driving force for your request for reallocation was the addition of advising duties and working with students which you claim shifts your work from office support to program support.

Summary of CWU's Reasoning

CWU explained that the reason for your request was Dr. Lupton's recognition and appreciation of your work for the department and his desire to find a mechanism for giving you a higher salary.

CWU acknowledged that other CWU departments use the program classes but argued that those positions are located in unique specialized areas that do not fall under an academic department *per se*. CWU argued that they looked very closely at your position and determined

that your area of work was not a program but was part of the main body of the department and the college.

CWU asserts that during their review of your position, they carefully reviewed your job description and found that your duties fell within different classes. However, based on a preponderance of your duties, they determined that the Secretary Supervisor class encompassed your supervisory responsibilities and addressed 60% of your work.

Rationale for Director's Determination

The purpose of a position review is to determine which classification best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of a position. A position review is neither a measurement of the volume of work performed, nor an evaluation of the expertise with which that work is performed. A position review is a comparison of the duties and responsibilities of a particular position to the available classification specifications. This review results in a determination of the class that best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of the position. Liddle-Stamper v. Washington State University, PAB Case No. 3722-A2 (1994).

It is clear from the exhibits that Dr. Lupton feels you are very good at your job and your work is highly valued. During the review conference, CWU HR confirmed your supervisor's and their appreciation for your work and dedication to the university. However, as stated above, a position review is not an evaluation of your expertise. Rather, a review is a comparison of the duties and responsibilities assigned to a position with the available classification specifications.

Duties and Responsibilities

In the Position Description Worksheet (Exhibits A-6 and B-2), your major duties are listed as:

35% Program Management:

- Represent Chair in his absence at university meetings and standing committees.

During the review conference, you indicated that you attend Executive Council Meetings including the Dean and task forces working issues such as building modifications and space management on behalf of the department. You clarified that at these meetings, you act on behalf of the Chair, have authority to commit to a course of action and have authority to agree to the schedule for future meetings.

- Research, interpret, and advise on institutional policies and procedures as needed.

During the review conference, you clarified that you advise faculty on issues such as degree requirements and pay provisions found in the faculty CBA.

- Ensure project financial objectives are met through budget preparation, analyzing expenditure spending, reconciliation and correction as needed.

- Establish priorities and monitor deadlines to ensure that projects, reports and updates are completed in a timely manner. Report the status of projects to the chair.

You described two projects that were both funded out of the existing department budgets. Both projects dealt with refurbishing existing facilities. One project was to create new office space and the other project was to refurbish a dedicated computer lab.

You worked with CWU facilities for space planning and you coordinated the acquisition of needed computer software and hardware for the lab.

- Represent ITAM as needed at staff, and/or College meetings, or presentations/conferences with the general public.

During the review conference you gave the examples of representing the College during student advising sessions, at job fairs, with WorkSource, with Labor and Industries and with a vocation rehabilitation firm.

- Meet with student advisees to develop a plan for program completion. Advise on program requirements, take action on various program related forms required by the Registrar's office. Review student progress, and remove advising holds as needed.

During the review conference, we discussed this item extensively. You indicated that when advising students you perform the same duties as faculty advisors for example, you meet with the student, develop an academic plan, remove holds, approve substitutions, etc. ITAM has approximately 1000 students in its academic programs and you are assigned as the advisor for 30+ majors and 180+ minors. In addition, you advise drop in students and act as a resource to faculty advisors. You explained that you have the most up-to-date information on the College's curriculum and changes and for that reason you might do more advising than faculty. You also explained that this is a duty you took on when your position became full time and that the time you spend advising students varies but you estimate it compromises approximately 10% of your time.

CWU explained that the university has a dedicated student advising department and that advising students is an expectation of faculty. CWU argues that advising students is not generally part of a Secretary Supervisor's role but acknowledges that Secretary Supervisors often provide information as the first point of contact for the department. To further explain this faculty responsibility, CWU provided information from the faculty Collective Bargaining Agreement. (Exhibit B-4)

- Plan, coordinate and oversee the academic support services for the ITAM department. Develop various department activities and provide assistance to faculty.
- Respond in a professional and timely manner to inquiries about degree programs, policies and procedures.

During the review conference, you clarified that inquires come from students and from outside agencies such as WorkSource and Labor and Industries.

- Initiate quarterly and annual faculty contracts, verify documentation and payments are submitted and paid as contracted.

During the review conference I asked you to explain what you meant by "initiate" and you described developing course schedules on an annual basis using information such as increase in the number of student, wait lists, low enrollment in certain classes, etc. After developing the master schedule of courses, you assign faculty and adjunct faculty then work with the chair to "fill the holes." You indicated that you initiate the schedule

and contracts and that Dr. Lupton signs off the documents. However, the Dean has final approval.

CWU explained that Department Chairs are responsible for developing academic programs and budget pieces. CWU acknowledges that you may provide input but contends that the authority ultimately lies with Dr. Lupton.

- Work with Chair, faculty, multiple Center Directors, Center Support staff and/or other faculty to create quarterly class schedules and submit to Registrar's Office by established deadlines.
- Access SAFARI to monitor and manage enrollment, adjust department's master course offering plan as needed, and notify Chair of instruction needs.

You explained that any time you submit a schedule or schedule change to scheduling, Dr. Lupton must sign off. You query the system and when you see a large wait list, you look at the budget to determine whether funds are available to offer an additional class. If the funds are available, you contact instructors to see if an instructor is available for an additional class and then you take the information to Dr. Lupton for approval. If he approves adding the class, you send the information to academic scheduling, create a contract request for the instructor and submit the information to the Dean for approval.

- Prepare all necessary forms and all required attached documentation for course and curriculum changes. Follow proper channels to obtain signatures, as well as submit to catalog.

You explained that the advisory board recommends what is needed to meet changes in the industry. You attend meetings and serve as a consultant. When the department decides what will be offered, you complete all the forms and submit the forms with necessary attachments to the Dr. Lupton. The change request is then routed through the Dean, the Provost, the registrar's office and finally the curriculum committee for approval.

- Oversee the summer schedule and contract request project. Including scheduling of courses, calculation of faculty salary and workload to determine profit/loss on each course, track enrollment and submit additional contract requests as needed during the quarter.

During the review conference, CWU explained that a lot of the duties you listed as program management duties are preparation and that the final authority lies with the Chair and the Dean. CWU asserts that Dr. Lupton is responsible for student advising activities for the department and that all faculty in the department are assigned to advise students.

25% Fiscal Management/Budget Planning:

- Project, monitor, reconcile and evaluate department budgets, prepare cost estimates to project income and expenditures for department programs.
- Initiate expenditures on department budgets to include ledger 1, ledger 2 and Foundation Project IDs (PID). This includes initiating requisitions, Pro-Card, and travel documents with the restraints of budget.

During the review, you explained that during the timeframe covered by this review, you signed off on travel documents. This process has since changed.

- Prepare budget status reports for the Chair and maintain spreadsheets detailing budget expenditures.
- Prepare initial budget allocations for eight PIDs.

During the review you explained that you work with various budget codes for goods and services, full-time faculty, tenured faculty, adjunct faculty, students and exempt employees. You determine what funds are needed for the year and submit the budget request to the budget department. You further explained that the bulk of department spending is for faculty contracts which are signed by Dr. Lupton.

- Maintain signatory authority for Pro-card and appropriate budgets in accordance with CWU and State guidelines.
- Prepare, process, and file all necessary requisitions, invoices, and purchases. Maintain accurate records, sign vouchers and initiate expense transfers.
- Analyze and reconcile any discrepancies.
- Contact vendors to correct any erroneous charges.
- Review travel reimbursements for the ITAM faculty and staff.

During the review conference, CWU reiterated that Dr. Lupton is ultimately responsible for the preparation and administration of the department budget. CWU agrees that you have authority to make purchases within the limits of the Pro-card which at the time of this review was limited to eight transactions that totaled no more than \$7,500 per month.

20% Office Management:

- Provide administrative support for complex instructional programs consisting of over 35 faculty and staff.
- Establish work priorities ensuring deadlines and due dates are met from various administrative office and annual academic calendar.

During the review you clarified that you set priorities for yourself and the staff you supervise to assure you meet deadlines such as those set by others for curriculum changes and contract requests. You set priorities for short and long term work as well as for ongoing work.

- Devise and implement procedures in department and interpret and apply rules and regulations, i.e., travel regulations, temporary hiring procedures, student employment, etc.

During the review conference you discussed hiring a department student as a student employee. While you worked with the department to identify the student, you also worked with the student employment office to complete the paper work after the student

was chosen. You also discussed coordinating funding for faculty travel requests during budget cuts.

- Attend department meetings and take minutes, as well as other meetings assigned by Chair. Compose letters, meeting notices, and other documents.
- Create and maintain electronic and manual files relating to the department, its programs and personnel such as: payroll, budgetary, equipment, grades, enrollment management, scheduling, confidential personnel files, student, faculty, Pro-Card, assessments, strategic plan, program review and historic records for operational and management purposes in compliance with institutional policies and regulations.
- Assist Chair in space management for the department, attending meetings and assisting with proposals.
- Order supplies, equipment, and software for the department and our computer lab.

During the review conference, you explained that your office assistant keeps track of supplies and lets you know they are running low. For ordering computer equipment, you work with the faculty requesting the equipment and with university IT purchasing to identify the equipment. You then authorize the purchase.

15% Personnel Administration and Staff Supervision:

- Assist Department Chair in HR functions including faculty searches, epafs, PeopleAdmin, position description, etc. as needed.
- Conduct search for classified office staff, prepare all necessary hiring paperwork, screen applicants, interview and recommend final applicant for hire.

When searching for classified staff, you work with CWU's HR staff to identify the job class and write the position description. Using questions provided by HR, you interview candidates and conduct reference checks. During the process, you may consult with other staff within the department including Dr. Lupton. After the verbal offer of employment is made, the Dean signs off on the paper work. The Dean is the ultimate hiring authority.

- Supervise civil service, temp, and student employees. Monitor time sheets, assign tasks, and review work performed. Develop position descriptions, dismissal, disciplinary action, and position allocations.

You work with HR to develop position descriptions and determine the proper allocation of positions. However, the authority to allocate positions lies with HR. In addition, the authority to hire, dismiss and discipline lies with the Dean.

- Review travel arrangements and reimbursements for ITAM personnel.
- Allocate work/projects to ITAM employees.

5% General Duties.

- Other duties as assigned.

Class Specifications

The following classification standards, in descending order, are the primary considerations in allocating positions:

- a) Category concept (if one exists).
- b) Definition or basic function of the class.
- c) Distinguishing characteristics of a class.
- d) Class series concept, definition/basic function, and distinguishing characteristics of other classes in the series in question.

In addition, while not allocating criteria, the typical work or examples of work statements provide support to the duties typically performed at each level within the class series and the Glossary of Classification Terms provides guidance for interpreting the language used in the class specifications.

You asked that I consider the Program Manager A and the Program Support Supervisor 2 classification. I also reviewed the Administrative Assistant 3 class and your current classification, the Secretary Supervisor.

In order to be allocated to a Program Support Supervisor or a Program Manager classification, the functions of a position must meet the "Program" definition. The State Human Resources Glossary of Classification Terms defines a Program as:

A specialized area with specific complex components and tasks that distinguish it from other programs (or the main body of an organization). A program is specific to a particular subject and has a specific mission, goals, and objectives. A program typically has an identifiable funding source and separate budget code.

The specific components and specialized tasks involve interpretation of policies, procedures and regulations, budget coordination/administration, and independent functioning. Typically requires public contact relating specifically to program subject matter, clients, and participants.

Duties are not of a general support nature transferable from one program to another. Performance of clerical duties is in support of an incumbent's performance of specialized tasks. Independent performance of these duties usually requires at least a six-month training period.

Your area of responsibility does not meet the definition of a "Program." Your work is an integral part of the ITAM academic department which is part of the College of Education and Professional Studies. You are not responsible for a specialized area with complex components and tasks that distinguish it from the main body of the organization. In addition, while your work is specific to ITAM, your duties and skills in areas such as assisting in budget development, monitoring and approving expenditures; staff hiring and supervision; curriculum coordination; initiating and completing the faculty contracting process; representing the department at meetings; having contact with outside agencies; student advising; and facility renovation, are transferable to other academic departments. Your area of responsibility does not meet the definition of a program and therefore, allocation to a Program Support Supervisor class is not appropriate.

In order to be allocated to a Program Manager classification, the functions of a position must meet the "Program" definition as discussed above and the "Program Manager" definition. The

State Human Resources Glossary of Classification Terms defines a "Program Manager" as having authority over:

- Developing program goals and objectives.
- Developing timetables and work plans to achieve program goals and objectives.
- Developing program policies and procedures.
- Preparing program budgets, adjusting allotments and authorizing expenditures.
- Controlling allocation of program resources.
- Setting and adjusting program priorities.
- Evaluating program effectiveness.

In addition, Program Managers administer, supervise, direct and advise on activities involved in providing an essential management service within the institution. They are responsible for advising and assisting, with minimal direction, the senior official and other administrators in the organization on matters pertaining to the program. The primary purpose of these positions is to achieve the goals and objectives of the program by providing, obtaining, and/or coordinating activities as they affect the institution. (See the Program Manager A definition and distinguishing characteristics, Exhibits A-9 and C-1).

Your position performs varied higher-level administrative and support duties but it does not have management-level responsibility for planning, coordinating and implementing all functions of a program. Further, management responsibility for ITAM rests with your supervisor, Dr. Lupton. It is clear that Dr. Lupton relies on you to support department goals, meet deadlines, interpret and apply department policies and procedures, etc. But, your area of responsibility does not meet the definition of a program and it does not encompass this overall scope of responsibility described by the Program Manager definition or the Program Manager A classification. Allocation of your position to the Program Manager classification is not appropriate.

The definition for the Secretary Supervisor classification states:

Supervise office support staff, interview and recommend selection of applicants, conduct training, assign and schedule work, act on leave requests, conduct annual performance evaluations and recommend corrective and/or disciplinary actions. Positions establish office procedures, standards, priorities, and deadlines and have frequent contacts with clients, the public, students, faculty, staff members from other departments, and management staff. Positions perform complex secretarial duties such as independently planning, organizing and prioritizing work to meet internal and external deadlines, monitoring and evaluating budget(s) status and initiating corrections, developing travel itineraries, compiling reports, studies, and applications, developing, modifying, and/or maintaining data base management, office record keeping, or filing system(s), coordinating office operations and initiating action to ensure work unit and/or office goals are met. Positions may perform administrative duties as delegated by the supervisor and/or provide and coordinate administrative support functions for a large unit.

Exercise independent judgment to accomplish assignments or solve problems and to develop new work methods, procedures, or strategies or modify existing work methods, procedures, and strategies to solve new or unusual problems. Work is

subject to review at the completion stage to determine effectiveness in producing expected results.

The Secretary Supervisor class encompasses your supervisory duties, addresses your frequent contacts with students, faculty and the public and encompasses monitoring and evaluation budgets. While not allocating criteria, the typical work statements for this class discuss duties such as coordinating office operations and representing supervisor(s) as delegated. While the Secretary Supervisors class encompasses some of your duties and responsibilities, it does not specifically include your responsibility for budget development, space/facility management, or advising students. While this class encompasses many of your duties and responsibility, there is a class that better encompasses the variety and majority of your duties and responsibility.

The definition for the Administrative Assistant 3 (AA3) classification states:

Positions perform varied administrative and secretarial support duties or positions are responsible for one or more major program activities under a second line supervisor.

Your position meets the AA3 definition. You perform varied administrative and secretarial support duties for the ITAM and the department Chair.

The distinguishing characteristics for the Administrative Assistant 3 class state, in relevant part:

Positions are delegated higher-level administrative support duties . . . that would be performed under a . . . head of a major organizational unit such as a school, college, or major academic or administrative department. Only one position will be allocated to an individual second-line supervisor for those positions performing one or more major program activities.

A major program activity is defined as a function that is a major element of the supervisor's job. The duty must stand alone and would create significant adverse consequences if poorly performed. However, full delegation can't occur if the supervisor's position requires specialized licensure such as attorneys, medical doctors, and engineers.

Higher-level administrative duties are duties of a substantive nature that are appropriate to be performed by the supervisor, manager, administrator, or professional level employee but have been delegated to the administrative assistant to perform. Areas may include but are not limited to, the following: budget development and/or management, expenditure control, office space management, equipment purchases, budget development and/or management, public relations, personnel administration, records management, and report preparation.

Incumbents in these positions represent the supervisor's and/or unit's goals and interests and provide interpretation or explanation of the supervisor's policies or viewpoints.

Your position meets the distinguishing characteristics of the AA3 class. Dr. Lupton is the Chair of the ITAM which "[a]ccording to Dr. Lupton is the largest department on campus." (Exhibits A-4 and B-1) He has delegated higher-level administrative support functions to your position. If you performed the functions of your position poorly, it would have significant adverse impact on the department. Your duties are of a substantive nature and include "budget development and/or

management, expenditure control, office space management, equipment purchases, budget development and/or management, public relations, personnel administration. . . ." In addition, you represent the department at meetings and provide interpretation of department policies and procedures. While this class does not specifically address the 10% of time you spend advising students, it does encompass representing the department's goals and interests and interpreting and explaining policies which are skills used in advising students.

While not allocating criteria, the typical work statements lend support to the duties encompassed by a class. The following typical work statements for the AA3 class describe your duties:

- Establishes procedures and interprets and applies administrative policies to the work of the unit;
- Evaluates costs and/or approves purchases for expenditures such as equipment, supplies, and furniture; develops cost estimates for equipment needs, space renovations, and projects;
- Participates in budget preparation; develops budget estimates; monitors budget status and expenditures;
- Assists in devising unit standards/procedures to ensure adherence to policies regarding tasks such as budgeting, purchasing, and contract administration;
- . . .
- Reorganizes and/or assigns office space; modifies workflow process to achieve efficient use of space, equipment, and personnel;
- Prepares reports, budget, contract, or grant proposals;
- Coordinates personnel issues such as recruitment, selection, appointment, and promotion;
- . . . represents supervisor at meetings;
- . . .
- Coordinates with other departmental staff members on administrative practices and procedures;
- . . .
- May supervise lower-level staff.

There is no dispute that your position has changed and that you have taken on additional duties such as advising students. However, when determining the appropriate classification for a specific position, the duties and responsibilities of that position must be considered in their entirety and the position must be allocated to the classification that provides the best fit overall for the majority of the position's duties and responsibilities. Dudley v. Dept. of Labor and Industries, PRB Case No. R-ALLO-07-007 (2007).

The overall majority of your duties and responsibilities fit the definition and distinguishing characteristics of the AA3 classification. Your position should be reallocated to the Administrative Assistant 3 classification.

Appeal Rights

RCW 41.06.170 governs the right to appeal. RCW 41.06.170(4) provides, in relevant part, the following:

An employee incumbent in a position at the time of its allocation or reallocation, or the agency utilizing the position, may appeal the allocation or reallocation to the Washington personnel resources board. Notice of such appeal must be filed in writing within thirty days of the action from which appeal is taken.

The mailing address for the Personnel Resources Board (PRB) is P.O. Box 40911, Olympia, Washington, 98504-0911. The PRB Office is located on the 3rd floor of the Raad Building, 128 10th Avenue SW, Olympia, Washington. The main telephone number is (360) 407-4101, and the fax number is (360) 586-4694.

If no further action is taken, the Director's determination becomes final.

c: Katelyn Muir, CWU
Lisa Skriletz, SHR

Enclosure: List of Exhibits

ELIZABETH HENRY v CWU
ALLO-14-002

A. Elizabeth Henry Exhibits

1. Request for Director's Review
2. Grounds for Requesting Director's Review of Position Reallocation
3. Statement of Remedy
4. Results of Classification Review
5. Supervisor Position Review Request Email
6. CWU Position Description Worksheet
7. Information Technology & Administrative Management Organization Chart
8. Employee Performance and Development Plan
9. State of Washington Class Specification for Program Manager A
10. State of Washington Class Specification for Program Support Supervisor 2
11. State of Washington Class Specification for Secretary Supervisor
12. Dispute of HR Consultant's Exhibits
13. Revised Organization Chart

B. CWU Exhibits

1. Allocation determination letter
2. Draft position description
3. Organizational Chart
4. Specific references in the Central Washington University/United Faculty of Central Collective Bargaining Agreement which define student advising as a Faculty responsibility. See starred articles: 13.4, 15.3.1 (a), and Appendix A, Article 1.1.5.

C. Class Specifications

1. Program Manager A
2. Program Manager B
3. Program Support Supervisor 1
4. Program Support Supervisor 2
5. Secretary Supervisor
6. Office Support Supervisor 3