



**STATE OF WASHINGTON
OFFICE OF FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT**

STATE HUMAN RESOURCES | DIRECTOR'S REVIEW PROGRAM

P.O. Box 40911 · Olympia, WA 98504-0911 · (360) 407-4101 · FAX (360) 586-4694

December 26, 2014

TO: Franklin Plaistowe, Section Chief
Workforce Planning, Performance and Rules and Appeals

FROM: Kris Brophy, SPHR
Director's Review Program Investigator

SUBJECT: Stefanie Menard v. Yakima Valley Community College (YVCC)
Allocation Review Request ALLO-14-021

This position review was based on the work performed for the six-month period prior to October 18, 2013, the date YVCC Human Resources (YVCC HR) received Ms. Menard's request for a position review. As the Director's Review Investigator, I carefully considered all of the documentation in the file, the exhibits, and the written comments provided by both parties. Based on my review and analysis of Ms. Menard's assigned duties and responsibilities, I conclude her position should be reallocated to the Communications Consultant 2 (CC2) classification.

Background

On October 18, 2013, YVCC Human Resources (YVCC HR) received Ms. Menard's Position Review Request (PRR) form, requesting that her Communications Consultant 1 (CC1) position be reallocated to the CC2 class (Exhibit B-2).

YVCC HR conducted a position review and notified Ms. Menard on February 21, 2014 that her position was properly allocated to the Communications Consultant 1 class (Exhibit B-1).

On March 3, 2014, State Human Resources, OFM received Ms. Menard's request for a Director's review of YVCC's allocation determination (Exhibit A-1).

On November 19, 2014, I conducted a Director's review telephone conference with the parties. Present for the conference were Stefanie Menard, Communications Consultant 1, YVCC; Steve Sloniker, Staff Representative, WPEA, and Mark Rogstad, Director of HR, YVCC.

Rationale for Director's Determination

The purpose of a position review is to determine which classification best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of a position. A position review is neither a measurement of the volume of work performed, nor an evaluation of the expertise with which that work is performed.

A position review is a comparison of the duties and responsibilities of a particular position to the available classification specifications. This review results in a determination of the class that best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of the position. Liddle-Stamper v. Washington State University, PAB Case No. 3722-A2 (1994).

Duties and Responsibilities

Organizational Structure

Ms. Menard works as a Communications Consultant in the Community Relations Office at YVCC. Her supervisor is Nicole Hopkins, Coordinator of Community Relations. Ms. Hopkins reports directly to the President. This unit provides media relations, public relations, graphic design, photography, event promotion and scheduling, web support, writing and other related communications support to the President's Office. Ms. Hopkins was absent during a portion of the review period for this appeal. During this time Ms. Menard was temporarily assigned to the CC2 class and reported to the President's Office. Ms. Hopkins was also available by phone. On September 1, 2013, Ms. Hopkins' returned at 75% time.

Position Purpose

Ms. Menard states in the PRR that her position exists to (Exhibit B-2):

...provide support to the Coordinator in producing timely and effective media relations...provide quality work with graphic design and content in promoting on-campus events and activities, through collaboration with the various departments. In addition...provide research, writing, design, layout, editing, and post production work for major campus publications including the campus update and commencement booklet....manage the facility use schedule for off-campus events and provide support for policy changes and management of campus procedures.

Major Job Duties

Ms. Menard's major job duties are summarized from the PRR as follows. A complete description of her assigned duties and responsibilities are provided in Exhibit B-2.

35% **Duty**

Major Booklet/Publication

Tasks

The Community Relations Office produces four major magazine style publications each year (the Campus Update and the Commencement Program). In addition, this past fall I worked with the Foundation Office to create a 35th Anniversary Report.

Campus Update: The Campus Update is a 16-20 page magazine that is produced by the Community Relations Office and distributed in both print and electronic format to the community, alumni, students, faculty, staff, and leaders around the state three times a year. Duties I am now in charge of include: yearly brand design, color selection, creation of graphic elements, cover photo selection,

working with the coordinator on outline development, research, and distribution in both print and electronic forms. In addition I maintain distribution of contacts and databases.

Commencement Program: The Commencement Program is distributed annually at YVCC's commencement ceremony. My role in this process is interviewing and writing biographies of both the commencement speakers and award winners, and sometimes photographing recipients. I also edit and revise the drafts several times before final placement. In addition, in the fall of 2010, I became in charge of the layout and content of the entire publication including student names.

Foundation Report: I worked independently with the Foundation Office to create a multipage booklet to commemorate their 35th anniversary. I created a brand design for their department to use on various projects, and was in charge of all aspects of the project including: color selection, writing, editing, creation of graphic elements, photography and photo selection, interviewing, layout, post production and distribution.

20% **Duty**

Promoting/Publicizing Events

Tasks

I work with campus departments on both the Yakima and Grandview campuses to promote events and programs to the public. In addition it sometimes involves working with various media outlets on possible story ideas. I work with the campus groups/departments to determine appropriate methods and techniques of disseminating information. For the past 2.5 years I have been the point of contact for event promotion on campus. Where I was once assigned duties from my supervisor within this category, I now work independently with little involvement or knowledge of my supervisor. Some of the events I promoted recently include:

- 2013-2014 Diversity Series Fall
- 2013-2014 Fall Faculty Lecture Series
- 2013 Sealant Day (English & Spanish Versions)

20% **Duty**

Website Updates

Tasks

Website Updates: Over the past two years my position changed to add several website elements including social media which I now generate content for and maintain on a daily basis. These websites are developed and are maintained by me with little to no involvement from my supervisor.

YVCC Voices: In the Summer of 2012 our office launched YVCC Voices, a student highlight website. This website has text, photos, and various video of various YVCC students. I helped in the initial development and design of the website. I am responsible for generating new highlights through contacting various departments, interviewing students, photography, writing, and video. I work

independently on generating this information and all student highlights posted to this site were written by me. My supervisor has only minor involvement by editing biography drafts.

College Press/News Blog: During the 2011-2012 academic year our office launched an online site for college news and press releases. I worked independently to maintain and determine what information should be posted in the "News" section. In addition, I write 90% of the press releases which get posted to the "Press Release" Section. In July/August 2013 I worked with YVCC's website designer to revamp our News blog into a version that is compatible with our new website.

SmugMug: During the 2011-2012 academic year our office launched a SmugMug online site that provides downloadable YVCC photos to campus for use in various publications and on the website. I worked to develop this site. I am responsible for maintaining this site by adding new photographs on a quarterly basis. In October 2013, I updated and rebranded the site to be more functional for the campus users.

ADX Calendar: During the 2010-2011 academic year our college purchased the ADX Calendar to replace calendars on the YVCC Website and My YVCC site. I was assigned the task of managing the calendar as its main administrator. I work independently to add event items, maintain user accounts, approve/forward for approval events, etc.

Facebook: In the fall of 2012 our office launched an official Facebook page to help promote YVCC news and events to the campus community. I developed this site independently, developed a social media proposal for our department, and also set up page feeds to link all of our websites. I am responsible for maintaining this site on a daily basis and independently determine what items to include and how to respond to specific questions/comments.

YouTube: I have been tasked with maintaining the site and generating new videos. I recently added four video highlights that I created to the site. Monitoring and adding videos to this site is done independently.

10% **Duty**

Photography/Video

Tasks

Photography/Video: I aid the Coordinator of Community Relations in photographing campus programs, staff, students, and events for inclusion on the website and in various publications. Photography work includes: shooting, downloading, and editing. In addition, in Fall 2012 I began shooting video as well.

5% **Duty**

General Graphic Design

Tasks

I work on a variety of graphic design projects throughout the academic year. I am involved in all phases of creation including initial design, editing, revising, and photo editing. I ensure that all required elements are present and that each project represents YVCC in a positive way. My duties changed with the addition of the college Graphic Designer position. Some examples of graphic design projects I have recently completed are as follows:

Outreach Department: I created a flyer to inform High Scholl Seniors of valuable deadlines for admission and testing. I also created a new brochure that is used by several campus departments including admission, registration, and counseling. In addition I am in the process of creating new outreach projects including a general poster, and rack card to be used when recruiting for new students.

5%

Duty

General Office

Tasks

General Office Operations/Representation on Committees: I perform several general office tasks and represent our department at many meetings/events. Examples of general office tasks are as follows:

Supplies, Mass Mailings, Gathering Mail, Representing the Community Relations Office at meetings, workshops, and conferences; Campus Committee involvement; Supervision of student worker; Proofreading, Support to the President's Office; Responsible for Emergency Preparedness duties when my supervisor is out of the office.

2%

Duty

Scheduling space for external organizations

Tasks

Facilities Use: Over the last three years there has been a huge reduction in my facilities use duties.

Scheduling – I work with outside agencies/organizations to determine if space is available and if the group/event fits within YVCC's guidelines set forth in the Facilities Use Policies and Procedures. If space is available I work with users to process requests and answer questions they may have. Billing them after the event for required changes/fees.

Decision Making – I make decisions independently on a daily basis about what events YVCC can host and whether event requests fit within the criteria for what is allowed.

3%

Duty

Working with Media

Tasks

I maintain a relationship with local media outlets by working to provide requests for information and interviews with campus individuals. I also maintain the media database for the community relations office, updating the database to reflect employee turnover.

Summary of Ms. Menard's Perspective

Ms. Menard asserts that her duties have grown over the past five years and that her job classification needs to be adjusted to reflect these changes. Ms. Menard asserts there has been an increase in the amount of time she spends working with no supervision due to her part-time supervisor's absence.

Ms. Menard asserts her position reaches the Communications Consultant 3 (CC3) class based on the level of independence in which she works and the nature of tasks that she performs. For example, Ms. Menard asserts she works under general direction rather than direct supervision. She asserts she independently leads or coordinates her work which is consistent with the CC 3 class.

Ms. Menard asserts she has the ability to resolve problems and conflicts independently or with general guidance and without supervisor involvement.

In total, Ms. Menard asserts her position should be reallocated to the CC 3 class.

Summary of YVCC's reasoning

YVCC asserts the scope of Ms. Menard's position duties do not reach the overall scope and level of responsibility for working at the CC 3 level class.

YVCC asserts Ms. Menard's position meets the CC 1 classification by performing generally recurring and routine Communications Consultant work under direct or close supervision. YVCC asserts her position does not have the scope of responsibility and she does not exercise the level of independence in performing her duties to warrant reallocation to the CC2 class.

For these reasons, YVCC asserts Ms. Menard's position is properly allocated to the Communications Consultant 1 Class.

Comparison of Duties

When comparing the assignment of work and level of responsibility to the available class specifications, the Class Series Concept (if one exists) followed by the Definition and Distinguishing Characteristics are primary considerations. While examples of typical work identified in a class specification do not form the basis for an allocation, they lend support to the work envisioned within a classification.

Communications Consultant series

The Class Series Concept for the Communications Consultant series states:

Positions in this series are involved in developing, editing and/or disseminating publications and a variety of communication and marketing materials as part of the overall public information function. This series also includes positions responsible for internal communications and strategic messaging, and positions serving as a spokesperson to the news media and the public.

The Communications Consultant series describes positions which prepare and disseminate publications and a variety of communications and marketing materials as part of an organization's overall public information function. This series also describes positions which are responsible for internal communications and strategic messaging and serving as a spokesperson to the news media. Ms. Menard's duties closely align with Communications Consultant work and her position should be allocated to a class within that series.

Comparison of Duties to Communications Consultant 3

The definition for this class states:

Positions at this level work independently and under general direction and typically lead or coordinate activities. Positions plan, organize, schedule, and carry out informational and/or public relations activities. Positions determine the need and most appropriate methods and techniques to publicize and promote programs, develop and implement changes for program effectiveness, and resolve complex issues or problems.

The Glossary defines "General direction" as follows:

(3) General direction

- Employee independently performs all assignments using knowledge of established policies and work objectives.
- Employee plans and organizes the work and assists in determining priorities and deadlines. May deviate from standard work methods, guidelines or procedures in order to meet work objectives.
- Employee exercises independent decision-making authority and discretion to decide which work methods to use, tasks to perform and procedures to follow to meet work objectives.
- Completed work is reviewed for effectiveness in producing expected results.

Ms. Menard's position duties do not reach the overall scope and level of responsibility required at the CC 3 level class.

While aspects of Ms. Menard's level of supervision reaches the definition of working under general direction with respect to her work assignments, her position does not have responsibility for leading and coordinating activities. She is not responsible for planning, organizing, and scheduling the communications and public relations activities for the Community Relations Office as required by this class. This responsibility rests with her supervisor, Ms. Hopkins. Further, the scope of Ms. Menard's duties do not include responsibility for determining the appropriate methods and techniques used by the office to publicize and promote college programs and services, or to develop and implement changes for program effectiveness. Finally, her position does not carry responsibility for resolving complex issues or problems at the level intended by this class. These duties are the responsibility of her supervisor, Ms. Hopkins.

Ms. Menard's position does not reach the requirements of the definition of this class. This is further supported in the typical work statements which provide examples of work performed at this level: Ms. Menard's position does not have responsibility for performing duties anticipated at this level such as:

Performs writing and editing duties relative to major communication projects;

Determines need for publicizing, interpreting, or promoting interest in programs, policies and services; selects methods and techniques of disseminating information; evaluates effectiveness of information program;

Meets with, and writes letters to, individuals and representatives of other organizations to furnish information about activities and to solicit participation in

educational and promotional programs; addresses and shows films to governmental, civic, fraternal, service, and other groups; plans and participates in conferences and workshops;

Maintains relations with departments, public, and private organizations to exchange information and promote communications programs; maintains liaison with administration to assure professional ethics and policies are observed;

Establishes and maintains publication schedules and coordinates schedules with production personnel to assure conformance with publication specifications; represents department when special handling or unusual production schedules are required; serves as department's agent in resolution of matters;

In total, the overall complexity of duties, level of analysis, scope of responsibility, and decision making authority of Ms. Menard's position does not reach the level encompassed in the CC 3 classification. Ms. Menard's duties do not reach the level of work described by this class.

For these reasons, her position should not be reallocated to the CC 3 class.

Comparison of Duties to Communications Consultant 1 and 2

The Definition of the Communications Consultant 1 class states:

Duties performed at this level include assisting in developing, editing, and/or coordinating production and distribution of materials or drafts of publications such as announcements, catalogs, program brochures, and illustrative materials. Positions typically work under direct or close supervision and work is subject to regular review. Work tasks are often repetitive or routine. Positions have limited latitude to resolve problems outside of written guidelines.

The State Human Resources *Glossary of Classification Terms* defines "Direct or close supervision" as follows:

(4) Direct or close supervision

- Supervisor or lead provides daily oversight of work activities.
- Employee is given specific instructions regarding duties to perform, assignments to complete and sequence of work steps and processes to follow.
- Employee follows clearly defined work procedures, processes, formats, and priorities.
- Work is frequently reviewed for accuracy, completion, and adherence to instructions and established standards, processes and procedures.

The Definition for the Communications Consultant 2 definition reads as follows:

Positions at this level work independently and under general supervision. Duties include performing original writing and/or editing assignments in the development and preparation of communication materials. Positions consult with clients and provide recommendations on things such as determining the most appropriate methods and techniques of designing and producing materials targeted toward a specific audience. Positions have increased responsibility in monitoring and

expediting progress during production and ensuring conformity to standards of style and quality. Positions bring unusual problems or issues to higher-level staff with possible options or solutions.

The Glossary defines "General supervision" as follows:

(5) General supervision

- Employee performs recurring assignments without daily oversight by applying established guidelines, policies, procedures, and work methods.
- Employee prioritizes day-to-day work tasks. Supervisor provides guidance and must approve deviation from established guidelines, policies, procedures, and work methods.
- Decision-making is limited in context to the completion of work tasks. Completed work is consistent with established guidelines, policies, procedures and work methods. Supervisory guidance is provided in new or unusual situations.

Key Factors

The key distinctions between the CC 1 and CC 2 classes are the amount of supervision and level of independence with which the employee works, the scope of work involved in performing routine versus original writing and editing work, the level of consultation provided to clients, and the degree of monitoring performed during the production phase of publication.

Level of Supervision

The overall focus and scope of duties and the level of supervision Ms. Menard receives in her position exceeds the requirements of Communications Consultant 1 class. As a whole, she performs her work with a higher level of responsibility and performs her work with more independence and less supervision than anticipated by this class.

First, the level of independence and scope of supervision Ms. Menard receives in performing her duties extends beyond working under direct or close supervision. Her position more accurately aligns with working under general supervision as stated in the CC2 class. This is consistent with the amount of oversight she receives, the latitude she has in determining the work methods and priorities to apply in completing her work, the scope and level of decision-making authority she has been delegated, and the extent to which her completed work assignments are reviewed.

For example, Ms. Menard reports to Ms. Hopkins, the Coordinator for the Community Relations Office. Ms. Menard stated during the review conference that she works collaboratively with Ms. Hopkins in determining her work assignments. Further, as stated in Mr. Rogstad's position allocation determination, Ms. Menard and her supervisor work together to discuss and plan the work to be performed by the Community Relations office (Exhibit B-1). Once assigned, Ms. Menard independently prioritizes and completes her daily work assignments, and her work is generally reviewed after it is completed.

Mr. Rogstad indicates in his comments that the office's processes are generally the same for all recurring publications. Ms. Menard and Ms. Hopkins first meet to discuss previous publications as a template and then discuss what roles each will play in developing the publication. Content for the publication is then drafted. Drafts are exchanged for editing and then placed into a template, and later approved by one or more supervisors. Ms. Hopkins therefore reviews and

checks the materials Ms. Menard produces before publication. As a whole, this level of supervision reaches beyond the scope of direct supervision in which the employee is given the specific assignments to complete, the specific instructions to perform, and the sequence of work steps and processes to follow to complete that work. This also reaches beyond the scope of direct supervision in which the work is frequently reviewed for accuracy, completion, and adherence to instructions. Therefore, in total, Ms. Menard's level of supervision and scope of independence in completing work assignments is more in alignment with the definition of general supervision in which the employee performs recurring assignments without daily oversight by applying established guidelines, policies, procedures, and work methods.

Decision Making Authority

Ms. Menard states in comments that she has independent decision making authority for the Campus Update magazine publications. This includes determining the yearly brand design, color selection, creation of graphic elements, cover selection, layout and post production that are produced by the department. She also works independently with regard to the annual Commencement publication. In the PRR she indicates that her duties include responsibility for determining the layout and content of the publication including student names. In addition, as stated in the PRR, Ms. Menard worked with the Foundation Office to create a multipage booklet to commemorate their 35th anniversary. She created the brand design for their department. Ms. Menard indicates that she completed the project independently which included responsibility for determining color selection, writing, editing, creation of graphic elements, photography and photo selection, interviewing, layout, post production and distribution. Thus, Ms. Menard's level of decision making authority is consistent with working under general supervision which reaches the CC2 class level.

Writing and Editing

The overall scope of Ms. Menard's duties reaches beyond the definition of the CC 1 class of assisting in developing, editing, and coordinating production and distribution of materials or drafts of publications. Her duties include responsibility for performing original writing and/or editing assignments in the development and preparation of communication materials consistent with the CC2 class definition. Ms. Menard writes original drafts of communication materials for the magazine style publications that are produced by the College Relations campus. For example, Ms. Menard writes original content for the Campus Update and other publications for the Community Relations Office at YVCC. She gathers background information by conducting research and personal interviews. She generates content for several website elements that includes social media. She also writes press releases which get posted to the "Press Release" Section of the College Press for the College. Ms. Menard also composes and edits materials for publication such as department brochures, advertising, marketing and promotional materials.

Consultation

Positions at the CC 2 level consult with clients and provide recommendations such as determining the most appropriate methods and techniques of designing and producing materials targeted toward a specific audience. Ms. Menard's duties are consistent with these requirements. For example, Ms. Menard independently works with departments on both the Yakima and Grandview campuses to determine timeline and methods for promoting campus events. She assists in determining the most appropriate methods for designing and producing materials to promote the event and development communication materials and other information.

Monitoring Production

Positions at the CC 2 level have increased responsibility for monitoring and expediting progress during the production phase and have responsibility for ensuring that printed materials conform to style and quality standards. During the review conference Ms. Menard indicated that her position has assumed increased responsibility for monitoring the production phases for the Commencement Program publication with the printing department. Therefore her duties are consistent with CC 2 level work which involves serving as liaison between client, publication, and production personnel to arrange for distribution of communication materials.

As a whole, the overall scope and level of responsibility assigned to Ms. Menard's position reaches beyond the requirements of the CC 1 class. Ms. Menard has the latitude to independently establish and adjust her daily work priorities and assignments. Ms. Menard completes original writing and editing assignments in support of campus publications and other electronic and hard copy communication materials. She completes the majority of her work assignments under the general supervision of her supervisor, Ms. Hopkins.

In total, when considering both class definitions and the level of supervision and decision-making Ms. Menard exercises in her position, the Communications Consultant 2 class provides a better fit.

In *Salsberry v. Washington State Parks and Recreation Commission*, PRB Case No. R-ALLO-06-013 (2007), the Personnel Resources Board addressed the concept of best fit. The Board concurred with the former Personnel Appeals Board's conclusion that while the appellant's duties and responsibilities did not encompass the full breadth of the duties and responsibilities described by the classification to which his position was allocated, on a best fit basis, the classification best described the level, scope and diversity of the overall duties and responsibilities of his position. *Allegri v. Washington State University*, PAB Case No. ALLO-96-0026 (1998).

Therefore, when determining the appropriate classification for a specific position, the duties and responsibilities of that position must be considered in their entirety and the position must be allocated to the classification that provides the best fit overall for the majority of the position's duties and responsibilities. Dudley v. Dept. of Labor and Industries, PRB Case No. R-ALLO-07-007 (2007).

In this case, the majority of the duties assigned to Ms. Menard's position and her level of responsibility and delegated authority are best described by the Communications Consultant 2 classification. Her position should be reallocated to the Communications Consultant 2 Class.

Appeal Rights

RCW 41.06.170 governs the right to appeal. RCW 41.06.170(4) provides, in relevant part, the following:

An employee incumbent in a position at the time of its allocation or reallocation, or the agency utilizing the position, may appeal the allocation or reallocation to the Washington personnel resources board. Notice of such appeal must be filed in writing within thirty days of the action from which appeal is taken.

The mailing address for the Personnel Resources Board (PRB) is PO Box 40911, Olympia, Washington, 98504-0911. The PRB Office is located on the 3rd floor of the Raad Building, 128

10th Avenue SW, Olympia, Washington. The main telephone number is (360) 407-4101, and the fax number is (360) 586-4694.

If no further action is taken, the Director's determination becomes final.

c: Stefanie Menard
 Steve Sloniker, WPEA
 Mark Rogstad, YVCC HR
 Lisa Skriletz, OFM

Enclosure: List of Exhibits

STEFANIE MENARD v YVCC
ALLO-14-021

A. Stefanie Menard Exhibits

1. Director's Review Form received March 3, 2014 (2 pages)
2. Campus Update produced March 2013
3. Campus Update produced June 2013
4. Campus Update produced December 2013
5. Commencement Program printed May 2013
6. Sealant Day poster February 2012
7. Biology Lecture Series press release
8. Radio Ad: *Cat on a Hot Tin Roof* script
9. YVCC Voices
10. Facebook
11. SmugMug
12. YouTube
13. ADX Calendar
14. News Blog
15. Original photograph
16. Groundbreaking invitation
17. Apply Now brochure
18. NCMPR District 7 Conference
19. Work Plan Update email
20. Alternate hours

B. YVCC Amended Employer Letter for Director's review, April 7, 2014 (5 pages)

1. Allocation determination letter February 21, 2014 (6 pages)
 - Job Description December 2010 (1 page)
 - Communications Consultant 1 YVCC Job Description
 - Communications Consultant 1 Classification Specification
 - Communications Consultant 2 Classification Specification
 - Communications Consultant 3 Classification Specification
2. Position Review Request Employee Portion October 18, 2013 (15 pages)
3. May 23, 2013 Email notice of beginning of Temporary Out of Class Pay Assignment (1 page)
4. September 11, 2013 Memorandum notice ending Temporary Out of Class Pay Assignment (1 page)
5. Job Description December 2010 (2 pages)

C. Class Specifications

1. Communications Consultant 1 Class Specification
2. Communications Consultant 2 Class Specification
3. Communications Consultant 3 Class Specification